



Final Learning Exercise Summary Report

Aragón, Spain – Action Plan 2021-2023

December 14, 2023

Monitoring entity:

GIGAPP Association. Research Group on Government, Administration, and Public Policies.

Responsible researchers:

- César N. Cruz-Rubio
- Álvaro V. Ramírez Alujas
- Pablo Redondo-Mora

Summary

The objective of this document is to present the main learnings and recommendations associated with the implementation of the First Aragon Action Plan in Open Government, using for this purpose the methodology suggested by the IRM and the Local OGP Program. Based on the implementation report, consolidate a final learning document associated with the entire cycle of the I Action Plan as a whole, which contributes to the development of future cycles of more robust and relevant action plans for Aragon.



Section 1. Local context

During the implementation of the First Open Government Action Plan, the Government of Aragon was able to successfully lead the implementation of its commitments and activities, as they were mostly included within the Strategic Plan of the General Directorate of Open Government and Social Innovation 2020-2023. These plans and actions have had political support at the highest level. These were, therefore, commitments that converged with the aforementioned agenda. Although participatory and open, both the design and co-creation process of the I Plan and its implementation were marked by an adverse in-person context, linked to the management and tensions caused by the COVID-19 pandemic. In this sense, the Government of Aragon, and the General Directorate responsible for the Plan, had to adapt and strategically reorient some of their missionary objectives, fundamentally those that had to do with face-to-face activities and with the reorientation of the improvement strategy to the portals. of transparency (see commitment 2) towards a more transparent management of emergency contracting associated with COVID-19, and which, therefore, were significantly affected in compliance with this Action Plan.

The implementation process operated in the absence of a monitoring system linked to a multi-stakeholder forum since the Government of Aragon relied on its innovation ecosystem embedded in the LAAAB. This allowed for greater effectiveness in the action, but at the same time a greater lack of knowledge about the existence of an Open Government Action Plan and about Aragón's participation in the Local OGP Program, as well as about the opportunities associated with it. Despite this, the team formed in that general direction, and its management team maintained the ambition associated with the activities of the LAAAB program and offered alternatives to overcome the restrictions imposed by the pandemic.

Like political support, his leadership was key in this process and revealed how important it is to have a capable and motivated team to advance these types of agendas. The advancement of key projects has also been a catalyst for a trained and motivated team, which, as a positive feedback process, contributed to the achievement or substantial progress in practically 70% of the commitments assumed in this First Plan. The change of government, the change of director, and the change in the name of the General Directorate now responsible for the Open Government agenda in Aragon occurred between September and October 2023, after the validity of this plan. These changes represent, from the perspective of the monitoring entity, a great stimulus and an important window of opportunity to promote a renewed agenda of openness, based on these learnings and new proposals for public and social innovation, since there is a solid motivated, and experienced team, in addition to endorsed support for this work agenda at the highest level.



Section 2. Action Plan Co-creation Process

2.1 Review of the co-creation process

The co-creation process was marked by mobility and in-person activities' restrictions associated with the COVID-19 crisis. This meant that the actions and meetings in the different phases of co-creation were necessarily held in a virtual format, thus constituting a challenge that was difficult to overcome for in-person and physical participation.

Despite this, the co-creation process was able to be strengthened, and where the first findings showed:

- An open and participatory process, which was structured in four specific phases. The boost provided by the engine group stands out. These efforts were aimed at designing the co-creation process and opening spaces and opportunities for dialogue and reflection associated with contributing ideas and proposals on the content and scope of the I Action Plan.
- Although this co-creation process had a solid roadmap that resulted in an ambitious action plan in its content, the commitments and activities that were included are a continuation of an existing strategic plan, and that includes some more innovative actions. , but which, in summary, reaffirmed an already established work agenda. An agenda, ambitious of course, based on a vision and idea of open government and innovation and that has been successfully transferred in recent years to Aragonese public management.

The weak points of the co-creation process were:

- Multi-actor forum was identified before it was configured, which shaped the co-creation process, but did not provide its own structure. The LAAAB ecosystem was used for this purpose, rather than forming a new instance, taking into account the strength of the already operational opening ecosystem. Although this allowed for an effective co-creation process, it had rather a modest and limited response in terms of involvement on the part of the civil society actors and agents outside the government summoned.
- This could also negatively influence the process of monitoring and monitoring progress, which did not occur.



2.2 Recommendations for the co-creation process

This section summarizes recommendations already included in the Inception Assessment document, reviewed based on implementation experience, and which can serve as a basis for future cycles of the co-creation process.

Regarding the co-creation process, the monitoring entity recommends:

1. Address the IRM standards associated with a multi-actor forum structure, that is, to generate a forum structure itself, which, taking advantage of the LAAAB ecosystem, and without contravening or duplicating the ecosystem of actors already identified or the participatory methodology developed, allows raising said participation standards, and make more visible the instances and means through which the monitoring of the commitments and milestones included within the Open Government action plan will be configured.
2. Given that the citizen oversees strategy associated with this participatory process did not generate any feedback, it is also recommended that the driving group at the plenary session, (or better yet, once configured, this forum or structured instance), define and communicate a route where the moments and priorities associated with the design and functions of the forum are made explicit, as well as the rules to articulate monitoring and citizen oversight processes for the development of the Action Plan. The objective is to guarantee that, during implementation, the second Aragon Action Plan in open government has effective monitoring tools and instances.
3. Closely linked to this issue, a recommendation (included within this implementation evaluation) is to use the PLGO application as a transparency standard, to effectively monitor all commitments derived from a second open government action plan, and in general to the agenda of this General Directorate of Institutional Relations, Foreign Action and Transparency.



Section 3. Action Plan Commitments

3.1 Review of the implementation of commitments

ESARG0001. Integration of underrepresented groups.

The ESARG0001 commitment. (Integration of underrepresented groups) is the most diverse and thematically complex of the three included in the I Action Plan. The general assessment of this commitment in its five initiatives and 24 milestones shows a high (substantial) level of compliance on time. Some of these initiatives have been awarded and enjoy international recognition. In general, it can be said that the progress of this commitment and the fulfillment of the substantive milestones included here decisively contributed to greater openness of the government, where underrepresented groups were able to have a voice, be trained, raise awareness, and participate in the improvement of public services and documents. This has been especially identified in the Social Impact Academy, Aspasia, and Easy Government initiatives, for the opening of genuine spaces for interaction (either because they were previously non-existent or because they have innovative elements in their design) and for the demonstration of their consolidation as projects that have allowed changes in government practice from different fronts and purposes. Regarding the actions defined and included in this Action Plan, the main learning identified by the monitoring entity is that the space-ecosystem of innovation and citizen action that the LAAAB of Aragon has built and maintains is an effective and necessary space to promote a more inclusive, open and innovative democracy, which allows for genuine, relevant and effective citizen participation models, as well as specific and oriented towards specific products and results. This ecosystem has proven to be capable of articulating innovative initiatives to serve groups that have historically been relegated or not considered in public debate and public policies. It has also proven to be capable of promoting more inclusive participation and changing the way we interact with people for the better, giving closeness and trust to citizens.

ESARG00002: Accountability and transparency

Excluding VisualGOB initiatives and clear communication actions, which consolidated greater government openness, and with 5 of 10 milestones concluded or with substantial progress, the general assessment of this commitment in its four initiatives and milestones shows limited compliance and marginal government openness. In global terms, and for reasons associated with a strategic change in action priorities within the COVID-19 context, of the three commitments-strategic lines included, it is the one that made the least progress in the period of validity of this First Action Plan. Even with this, we highlight some very relevant advances and results associated with the transparency portal (in response to the COVID-19 crisis) and VisualGOB as an expanded transparency



tool aimed at accountability. The grouping of projects and initiatives within this commitment and their level of compliance assessed for this action plan encourage us to reflect on what learning can be incorporated into a larger debate, linked to the promotion of greater public transparency and greater or more robust public accountability, based on an integrated action strategy. The First Action Plan of Aragón in Open Government clearly had an action strategy in the matter, consistent with its time and associated with a specific reality that was intended to be improved. The strategic reorientation to which its actions were subjected was due to budgetary limitations and a crisis like the one suffered thanks to the COVID-19 pandemic. Although this has not favored the fulfillment of this Action Plan and its activities, the learning associated with it shows that said strategic reorientation generated fruits and was worth it, since it had positive effects and met relevant public information demands, which allowed us to achieve higher levels of public transparency associated with the management of economic resources linked to the pandemic. The huge increase in the transparency of website visitors is one of several pieces of evidence that accounts for such success.

(ESARG0003). Innovation ecosystems and new alliance models

The assessment of this commitment in its 8 milestones shows a level of substantial compliance, being of course, a commitment that breaks down key actions to consolidate the physical and virtual space of the LAAAB as the primary part of the government openness and public innovation strategy. of Aragón, from where its main or most notable projects and initiatives are structured. It stands out for its value and contribution to government openness, the development of teaching materials linked to the HIP methodology, the development of the Virtual LAAAB, and the service redesign workshops under the HIP methodology.



3.2 Commitment recommendations

Recommendations

(ESARG0001). Integration of underrepresented groups.

The open government approach is successfully inserted into the DNA of the work carried out within the LAAAB. Under the definition of this strategic line of integration of underrepresented groups, it would be possible that the future actions of the LAAAB will guide its work on new projects or on the reactivation of successful ones, which seek, for example, to serve and give voice to the Romani community¹, to the agenda against depopulation² to the immigrant population in its diversity³, from older adults⁴ in situations of social vulnerability or unwanted loneliness⁵, to the different target groups of care policies. Also to new projects, to solve other important problems of youth and adolescence, the fight against abuse and cyberbullying, the fight against technological addictions, to promote a more successful job insertion, the fight against machismo in its different expressions, etc. as a means to advance even further in this strategic line, and from ideational debates and the experience already acquired, identify challenges of urgent and priority attention and innovative attention strategies, to guarantee rights, to favor inclusion and articulate these democratic spaces from the LAAAB and innovative.

OpenKids - Recommendations

1. Provide continuity to this ambitious agenda, incorporating initiatives into the LAAAB Laboratory that allow for more actions to be articulated in the territory, and reactivate the approval process of the Councils for Children and Adolescents.
2. It is recommended that, in the design and co-creation phases of the plan, special attention be taken to improve the wording of the commitments, to make them the most specific and verifiable.

Social Impact Academy - Recommendations

¹There are no updated statistics, but a 2019 report puts them at more than 15,000 romani people for 2015 into Aragon. See URL <https://www.foessa.es/main-files/uploads/sites/16/2019/06/3.12.pdf>

²According to data from the National Institute of Statistics (INE) for 2022, almost 80% of Aragonese municipalities have lost population in the last decade, and only 11% of the Aragonese population lives in municipalities with less than 5,000 inhabitants. See news at URL: <https://www.heraldo.es/noticias/aragon/2022/12/07/casi-ocho-cada-diez-municipios-aragoneses-han-perdido-poblacion-ultima-decada-1617040.html>

³According to a report by the Workers' Commissions (CCOO), the non-Spanish population of Aragon, as of January 2020, there were 148,724 foreign people, representing 11.28% of the total population of that CCA, see URL at <https://aragon.ccoo.es/709e1bd61d5e5f99bc75cdaed8d95386000051.pdf>

⁴According to the Atlas of Aragon, there are almost 270,000 inhabitants over 65 years of age, 20.07% of the total population of that Autonomous Community.

⁵It is calculated according to the latest data from the INE, corresponding to 2020, that in Aragon there are 73,200 people over 65 years of age who live alone, of which 47,400 are women and 25,800 men, many of them in rural areas. See news at URL:

<https://www.heraldo.es/noticias/aragon/2023/09/27/deteccion-soledad-no-deseada-aragon-presegura-entidades-trabajan-con-personas-mayores-1680393.html>



1. Alliances work. It is suggested to increase and deepen alliances in the technical part that allow the LAAAB to have that specialized support, even from alliances or entities outside of Aragon, such as those that could be made with other governments or innovation laboratories that work on related topics.
2. Design and implement an alumni SIA network.
3. Establish a system of economic incentives or travel support (scholarships) for participants. It is suggested to look for a sponsorship system.
4. Consider the possibility of making thematic editions of the SIA, which are associated with specific problems faced by young Aragonese, in terms of mobility, quality of life, use of urban space, employment and access to employment, environment and sustainability, physical health and mental, etc.
5. Consider the scalability of the project. This is an initiative that has achieved a significant margin of consolidation, so an escalation to increase social return, or its potential replication in other Autonomous Communities or subnational governments, in the context of the work plans of other similar or regional laboratories. from other countries.
6. Improve the post-editing strategy, in order to make project monitoring more effective, and define a more robust support strategy.

Hateblockers Initiative - Recommendations

1. Consider continuing the project. It is an initiative with its own identity, whose deployment is still necessary because hate ⁶and fake news are still there.⁷
2. Support a reactivation of the Hateblockers community, seek support from friendly networks and financing to generalize their knowledge, the use of the tools designed and made available, train in the use of Hateblockers tools, scale this project to more public schools, (for example For example, to youth associations, leisure and free time associations, volunteering, and above all, go to schools with cases of xenophobia, racism, speeches that legitimize violence in the school environment and other situations associated with hate speech on the networks. social).

⁶In Spain there is an observatory on Racism and Xenophobia (OBERAXE) that has monitored the evolution of hate messages on social networks and trends. To access the bimonthly OBERAXE newsletters published since 2020 at the URL: <https://www.inclusion.gob.es/oberaxe/es/ejes/discursoodio/index.htm>

⁷The data shows that the fake *phenomenon news* is still present. According to a survey carried out between April and May 2022 (N=1000 people over 15 years of age), 40% of the Spanish population stated that they had been exposed to fake news or misinformation often or very often. For their part, less than 5% said they had not suffered exposure to fakes . *news on any occasion*” which leads one to think that the remaining 95 have been. See data at URL: <https://es.statista.com/estadisticas/1369943/porcentaje-de-la-poblacion-expuesta-desinformacion-y-noticias-falsas-en-espana/>



3. Promote and disseminate studies on this problem, especially due to its social relevance when designing policies, where hate speech does not simply remain on social networks, and in fact, is a predictive factor of events and acts that have effects in real life.⁸
4. *know-how* creation strategy *how*, training trainers in Hateblockers and in the use of its tools, to make it another resource available to groups concerned about these issues, with materials and access to training capsules in several languages. The groups could be *influencers*, associations of mothers and fathers, associations that fight against exclusion, cyberbullying, techno-addictions, and the responsible use of the Internet, that fight against xenophobia or racism, promoters of open or participatory journalism, and/or groups that promote mental health in children and adolescents.

Aspasia Initiative - Recommendations

1. Incorporate spaces for transversal participation in a gender key at the local level, with a program of “Aspasia delegates” in each Aragonese local government, which operates as a link to channel information, feed the observatory, promote activities and new entries on Wikipedia, etc.
2. Reinvigorate the work already done through a program to promote Aspasia materials in RRSS.
3. It is also important that the Aspasia Observatory observes and monitors everything that is proposed by Aspasia and implemented. Become an observer of the changes that this same initiative drives. Document the effects caused by the implementation of the recommendations derived from the workshops and participatory actions included in Aspasia.
4. It is also recommended to strengthen the Observatory's actions, expanding its axis of action, generating capacities, and defining on paper an experiential methodology for forming #AspasiaObserva observatories and generating its main knowledge products, to enable their replication by other governments. and institutes similar to the Women's Institute.

Easy Government- Recommendations

1. Plan a communication strategy for project replication.
2. Advance in supporting interested governments,

⁸For example, there are studies that indicate that it is possible to predict the frequency of hate crimes in real life with hate speech on Twitter. See URL: <https://www.nyu.edu/about/news-publications/news/2019/june/hate-speech-on-twitter-predicts-frequency-of-real-life-hate-crim.html>



3. Develop materials and guides to articulate this initiative, centralize information on the progress of the initiative in these governments and based on accumulated experience,
4. Consider from the LAAAB the creation of an Ibero-American or international Easy Government network. Thinking about forming a community of practices in these first phases of deployment could point to this line of progress.

Recommendations

(ESARG0002). Accountability and transparency.

Today, it remains pending, therefore, from the current General Directorate of Institutional Relations, Foreign Action, and Transparency, to redefine a new agenda of transparency and accountability, maintaining ambition, using the technologies and ways that have proven to be effective and promoting success, expanding the focus, better linking the value of public accountability, incorporating structural improvements to the transparency portal with other spaces within the ecosystem of websites of the Government of Aragon already configured, towards full navigability, towards improvements based on an accurate and updated diagnosis of needs and opportunities to expand the current standards of public transparency, from a citizen perspective, and through the application of technological advances and web resources, one of them developed in-house (PLGO), and which has great potential as a mechanism associated with accountability.

Transparency Portal and advances in clear communication -recommendations

This OGP Local report recognizes the enormous impetus involved in generating and publishing information in the face of the COVID-19 emergency as one of the great milestones achieved by the Transparency Area of the government of Aragon. The response and adaptation capacity of the Transparency team and the General Directorate of Open Government and Social Innovation as a whole is also recognized, in the face of a changing and adverse context, which made it possible to prioritize action strategies in the face of such strong restrictions. However, as they are not milestones and activities defined in this plan, they are not the direct object of this evaluation, while key actions included in the plan that were not carried out or initiated are identified, so compliance is assessed as limited, and It is valued at a marginal level of government openness. The main recommendations of this group of activities are:

1. Make a strategic effort in this mandate that is beginning, aimed at resuming this process of improvements within the framework of your new Government Strategy.
2. Provide the responsible department with the necessary resources and personnel
3. Articulate the improvements to this website in a participatory way, using the spaces configured in the LAAAB, the participation of its ecosystem, the academy, and other



relevant actors, without leaving aside the priorities associated with better web usability, improving navigability, search engines, clear language

4. In this strategic step, the vision could be to integrate the different public information websites (the open data portal, the budget transparency portal budget.aragon.es, generalize the use of the PLGO interface on which VisualGOB is based within of the transparency portal), and integrate as much as possible the functionalities, image, navigability of the interfaces of the portal of www.gobiernoabierto.aragon.es and LAAAB.es in an integrated web ecosystem of transparency and openness.
5. Within the framework of the SDA 2022-202 strategy, it is recommended to strengthen this cooperation between the SDA and the current General Directorate of Institutional Relations, External Action and Transparency. Also, the work carried out is documented and know-how is defined from Aragon. how, a transversal model of autonomous intervention in language and communication, which offers guidance and orientation to other Autonomous Communities, which allows the consolidation of capacities and knowledge in employees and public officials to the transparency units, beyond Aragón.
6. It is recommended to resume the satisfaction survey and include this activity in the framework of a participatory strategy for the redesign of the transparency portal during the current government period since this section linked to the right of access to information could greatly benefit from a line diagnosis of perception of this service and its levels of satisfaction on the part of citizens.

VisualGOB - Recommendations

1. Provide continuity to the evolution of visualGOB, to make it better reach more governments. Like many similar technological developments, it may require not only a bundling strategy, but a strategy that expands its scope of use beyond government commitments, thus offering a comprehensive open-source software solution, with expanded transparency and for Pay accounts.
2. This new strategy would also require a promotional campaign, a call for the formation of a community linked to the improvement of the application, and the development of scripts that can later be used as a plugin or as a component for the most used CMS content managers (WordPress, Drupal), in organizing events, creating and maintaining a community of practices, etc. With the generalization of its use, a new standard of public transparency could be configured, one that is directly linked to transparency focused on plans and the main strategies of public policies and programs.
3. VisualGOB is executed, to make it closer to an accountability tool, such as:
 - o improve the web interface and include engines to allow searches by words or phrases.



- o Include an interface or section that allows third parties to request additional information, ask questions, and share contrasting information not included by the government. Ultimately functions as an interactive system that promotes active listening
 - o To certify that it is updated in real-time, a space should be included that provides access to a chronology of system changes (log), where each update has an entry date. Perhaps, based on blockchain technology, a technology could be configured that provides a direct means of corroborating updates in real-time and prevents the unwanted or malicious deletion or alteration of records, thus consolidating a useful, publicly reliable, and open system. for public scrutiny, compliance *reporting* and accountability of key government policies and strategies.
4. Another logical recommendation, associated with its potential for replication in terms of improvement, is to consider the possibility of using this interface to include the main commitments or strategies assumed by all areas of the government of Aragon, not only those of the new Government Plan, as has already been explored, so that this tool offers an expanded and more relevant service for transparency, and allows public accountability processes in more public policy sectors.

Recommendations

(ESARG0003). Innovation ecosystems and new alliance models.

By 2024, the Government of Aragon faces not only the challenge of continuity and consolidation of this set of initiatives and projects but also the definition and consolidation of a new and more ambitious strategy to strengthen and consolidate the LAAAB and its initiatives by national or international level, based on the promotion of the HIP methodology, the improvement, and refinement of the most outstanding initiatives with the potential for replication, as well as the updating and improvement of expanded public transparency towards more intuitive and close models of tools for Pay accounts. The main implementation learnings and recommendations of this initiative could be associated with:

1. The creation of an ecosystem requires continuous networking, generating and maintaining a presence in international forums. The centrality of the LAAAB based on its current capacity requires promoting actions in a decentralized manner, where the role of the LAAAB is one of several in the national, European, or Latin American context. It is clear that a strategy for structuring the territory and decentralizing the LAAAB must be associated primarily with an autonomous context. But the LAAAB, as a consolidated public innovation ecosystem, would be called upon at this time to cross borders in this process of building networks of organizations that promote public innovation globally. An already advanced resource at hand is precisely to



advance in its virtuality with more ambition, without neglecting the face-to-face, and a key tool for this purpose is its methodology based on the HIP model.

2. Another recommendation is to hold exhibitions on public innovation also outside the LAAAB, for example, through temporary exhibitions in the halls of the headquarters of the Government of Aragon, where the work of social and public innovation developed in the autonomous community is exhibited.
3. In the opinion of the monitoring entity, the main and most important of the steps taken in this direction was the design and definition of a methodology (HIP Model), whose promotion, dissemination, and application have allowed testing its usefulness, as well as putting into practice the world map to LAAAB as a reference for openness and public innovation. But little is known about the effects and results that have been observed with its use and implementation. It is therefore necessary to seek to value these results and impacts.
4. Together with the HIP methodology, the main *asset* or capital value of the LAAAB is in its team of direct collaborators and institutional allies, a professional and human talent that has allowed it to provide leadership to the work, achieve very outstanding collective results in the face of challenges and innovations about which there was no previous experience, combining agendas, integrating priorities and diverse groups into common objectives.
5. Finally, the political support at the highest level that the LAAAB team had in the design and implementation of the First Action Plan has been essential and a guarantee of continuity on which the LAAAB team has been able to generate these advances in terms of transparency, public and openness, applying an original model focused on this space ecosystem.

How to cite this document?

Cruz-Rubio, CN, Ramírez-Alujas, AV, & Redondo Mora, P. (2023). *Aragon's I Action Plan in Open Government 2021-2023 (Open Government Partnership -OGP Local Program)*, 13 pp. GIGAPP Association.